

## Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

### Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

<b>Subject</b>	Studies/Research/Best Practices Subcommittee Meeting #3 Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Planning Framework	<b>Date</b>	April 12, 2021
<b>Facilitator</b>	Dr. Robert Weiss	<b>Time</b>	11:00am – 12:30am
<b>Location</b>	WebEx - <a href="https://governor.virginia.gov/i/uu8jn">https://governor.virginia.gov/i/uu8jn</a>	<b>Scribe</b>	Ashley Samonisky

Invitees/Attendees			
#	Name	Organization/Role	Attended?
<b>Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee Members and Staff Advisors</b>			
1.	Dr. Robert Weiss - Chair	Director, Center for Coastal Studies at Virginia Tech	Y
2.	Emily Steinhilber – Vice Chair	Coordinator, Commonwealth Center for Recurrent Flooding Resiliency at Old Dominion University	Y
3.	Shurui Zhang - Staff	Commonwealth Coastal and Marine Policy Fellow, Virginia Sea Grant	Y
4.	Elizabeth Andrews	Director, Virginia Coastal Policy Center at William & Mary Law School	Y
5.	Jessica Grannis	Coastal Resilience Director, Audubon	N
6.	Dr. Carl Hershner	Emeritus Professor of Marine Science, Virginia Institute of Marine Science at William & Mary	Y
7.	Whitney Katchmark	Principal Water Resources Engineer, Hampton Roads Planning District Commission	Y
8.	Dr. Mark Luckenbach	Associate Dean for Research and Advisory Services, Virginia Institute of Marine Science at William & Mary	Y
9.	Catherine C. McGhee	Director of Research and Innovation, Virginia Transportation Research Council	Y
10.	Dr. Karen McGlathery	Director, Environmental Resilience Institute at the University of Virginia	Y
11.	Ashley Montgomery	Associate Designer, Hanbury	Y
12.	Mary-Carson Stiff	Wetlands Watch Policy Director, Wetlands Watch	Y
13.	William “Skip” Stiles, Jr.	Executive Director, Wetlands Watch	Y
14.	Carlos Rivero	Chief Data Officer	N
15.	Dr. Robert S. Young	Geology Professor, Program Director for the Study of Developed Shorelines, Western Carolina University	Y
<b>Scheduled Speakers</b>			
16.	Dr. Anamaria Bukvic	Assistant Professor, Department of Geography, Virginia Tech	Y
<b>Designated Alternates</b>			
<b>Subcommittee Advisors</b>			
17.	Shep Moon	Coastal Planner, Virginia CZM Program	Y
<b>Other Participants</b>			
18.	Ann Phillips	Rear Admiral, US Navy (Ret.) – Office of the Governor	Y
19.	Matt Dalon	DCR	Y
<b>Consultant Support</b>			
20.	Brian Batten	Dewberry	Y
21.	Johanna Greenspan-Johnston	Dewberry	Y
22.	Ashley Samonisky	Vision Planning and Consulting	Y

## Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

### Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
1.	Welcome and Chapter 1289 Reading	<p>Dr. Weiss provided an introduction on how the meeting will proceed, meeting etiquette, and requested participants to ask questions through the chat box. Public comments will be taken during the last 30 minutes of the meeting from the chat box from those attendees who registered to speak. He then read through the required Chapter 1289 virtual meeting language.</p> <p>Please contact Shurui Zhang at phone: 217-979-8438 if you have any connectivity issues.</p>
2.	Roll Call and Quorum Affirmation	<p>Dr. Weiss took roll and advised that a quorum was present. He then asked for a motion to move forward with the virtual meeting. Emily Steinhilber moved and Rob Young seconded. Motion Passed unanimously.</p>
3.	Consultant Support Introduction	<p>Ann Phillips provided an introduction to the Dewberry Team and advised of their roles and the administrative support they will provide. Brian Batten (Dewberry) provided an introduction to the Team and all partnering Subconsultant firms.</p>
4.	Approval Today's Agenda and Past Minutes	<p>Dr. Weiss asked for a motion to approve the agenda for the current meeting before proceeding - moved and seconded. Motion passed unanimously.</p> <p>Dr. Weiss asked for any comments or corrections from the previous meeting's minutes. No comments. Motion passed to accept minutes as distributed.</p>
5.	<p>Presentation - <i>Advancing towards the sustainable relocation strategy: lessons learned from the empirical evidence</i> - Dr. Anamaria Bukvic</p>	<p>Dr. Weiss provided an introduction to Dr. Anamaria Bukvic, an overview of her work at Virginia Tech, and her fellowships and accomplishments.</p> <p>Dr. Bukvic gave some background on relocation and various studies supporting the need for adaptation, and eventual relocation in the future, and then provided a presentation on the empirical information on migration and population movement. (See Slide Attachment)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Q – Dr. Rob Young – Great summary of the issues faced. This is a very interesting area of study. The vast majority of the research involves communities described as middle/working class communities. One of the biggest issues we have of tackling a managed retreat plan is the disparity between the way we treat resort communities and how we treat working class communities. The NJ Blue Acres program has a successful buyout program, but has been told to stay off the barrier islands. There are no good examples of buyouts in resort communities in NJ. In Sandbridge, VA investment properties would have different criteria for selling than a working-class homeowner would. We spend billions on investment resort communities and struggle find funds for working, blue collar, and non-investment communities. How do we look at both of these at the same time? Buyout plans are always lower income, never in investment properties, yet that is where the money goes every year, to protecting those investment properties. We have spent millions on beach replenishment that could have been better used in lower income communities with mitigation and relocation projects. This is not a fair distribution. It is true this is lower income communities? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ A – Dr. Bukvic – I do believe relocation is a very difficult decision to make, we view this as a last resort option. We only looked at communities having the highest risk or most damages from storm</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

## Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

### Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>surge, nuisance flooding, etc. We are only looking at communities likely impacted significantly enough to look at relocation in the future. We found the age of residents makes a major difference in those willing to relocate. We did not conduct research in low-income communities, but we recognize this is an important next step.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Dr. Weiss advised a Blue Acre's representative will be coming to the meeting on April 26th at 10am.</li> </ul>
6.	Working-Group Updates	<p>Dr. Weiss asked for updates from the relocation working group. An email was sent to members with a spreadsheet to collect input on initiatives and mechanisms from other states with a request to edit/add to the columns to identify what information the students will need to collect. Are there any questions? No Comments/Questions.</p> <p>Dr. Weiss asked Dr. Anamaria Bukvic to serve as an advisor to this Subcommittee and to provide a writeup on her research as it relates to relocation. This document will be shared with the rest of the working group. Dr. Weiss also asked Elizabeth Andrews to provide a writeup on the legal aspects of relocation. Dr. Weiss will send an email to the relocation workgroup with a request to provide availability in the last week of April/early-May to discuss the relocation workgroup.</p> <p>Mary-Carson Nature provided updates on the nature-based infrastructure working group. They are looking to get a meeting on the calendar for the next two weeks. A Doodle Poll will be in circulation just before the meeting. Meeting topics will discuss expanding the group to include grey and green infrastructure, deliverables, timelines, students willing to work on this project, etc. The goal of moving forward is stalled by what is actually needed from the Subcommittee. What format and deliverables are required? What are they intended to look like? A project ID approach was brought up, but has not been agreed upon, but is included as one of Dewberry's deliverables. This needs to be discussed so valuable time is not wasted. The direction needs to be established now.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ann Phillips – According to the Framework Document, Chapter Six, there are recommendations that address many topics not related to the Master Plan. I would be careful not to redo work in progress or work that will be addressed in the future. I think there would be a better use of everyone's time. PDCs have a lot to do with this as well and the CBPA public comment period still underway. Also, the flood grant public comment period is in progress.</li> <li>• Elizabeth Andrews – I agree with Ann, let the regulatory processes play out. We cannot supplant the authority's role. However, in future iterations of the Plan we can do a gap analysis. In reference to the spreadsheet, I added a column to the spreadsheet, however I am not sure what this will relate to Dewberry's goals. The column I added asked how the solutions take into consideration socially vulnerable populations. As Rob said, there is a disparity between how we spend our dollars. We need to find the lessons learned on these special needs for various populations. What is our goal for this information? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ A – Dr. Weiss – I would like an overview on what other states/areas have done specifically with relocations, science, solutions, are these measures working, etc. Any resources or documents available, etc. We will then review this database as a subcommittee, and rate the</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

## Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

### Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		<p>solutions or processes for: if they may be possible in Virginia; is it a good process; and what will we need to make it work. Other solutions may not be bad, they just may not work for Virginia. This information should be collected by students and assistants over the summer, and use our time to review and rate them.</p> <p>Dr Weiss asked if Dewberry wishes to comment on Mary-Carson’s question.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Brian – I agree there may be some overlap. From my understanding we are doing an analysis identifying where opportunities for managed retreat may exist, but we will not be delving into rule compliance and other criteria this committee is looking into. Voluntary retreat/acquisition are tools we will include in the toolbox for the State. But looking for the opportunities for where it might happen, due to high frequency or permanent inundation, is the goal for Dewberry.</li> <li>• Ann – The Strategic Coastal Resource Handbook is not a task for the contractors. Just to clarify.</li> <li>• Mary-Carson - I see that the relocation group does not overlap with Dewberry. I can have a conversation with Brian to flesh out the specifics.</li> <li>• Whitney Katchmark – Brian, can you brief the NNB workgroup on whether you are on schedule and completed the Data Gathering and if so, what was included? Then we could discuss the Impact Assessment before it is complete. How far along is Dewberry? Can we get a brief?             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Ann - The workplan, due today, will outline this and we will update the schedule at the TAC next week.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Ashley Montgomery provided updates on the outreach efforts. Current working goals were discussed and a Doodle Poll will be sent to coordinate with the rest of the work group. While looking to the Framework for language, the message will be framed with equity at the forefront. The second goal is to meet with organizers, businesses, and other representatives to build equity into best practices. To provide equity for communities, we want to pull from the best-case studies for this, so efforts are both collaborative and comprehensive. We want to build equity in the engagement and project evaluation processes. Process must be nimble enough to work in different spaces. Our last goal is to define deliverables and how this should be a performative process. Our group will work through how to apply equity to the various processes for the Master Plan.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Karen – We have a similar issue in that we agree on collecting case studies and possible solutions. What is our role in suggesting a process, that stays in line with Dewberry’s responsibilities?             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Dr. Weiss asked for members to meet with Dewberry offline to discuss these topics, and asked for Dewberry to engage with the working groups individually moving forward. Dr. Weiss will introduce the working group leads to Brian so they can communicate offline.</li> <li>○ Ann – Dewberry is pursuing sources of data for the risk analysis, but you may know of additional input/data.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

## Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan

### Technical Advisory Committee – Studies, Research, and Best Practices Subcommittee

Agenda/Minutes		
#	Agenda Item	Minutes
		Additional Work group resources – Shuri has agreed to do research and Dr. Weiss will have an additional student join in May. Elizabeth will also have a student/RA in late May to assist with research. If anyone else has assistance to offer, please contact Dr. Weiss.
7.	Discussion and Comments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Q – Dr. Young - In regard to that regulatory role, could we get a brief of list of what is currently underway?                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ A - Mary-Carson Stiff - We are trying to track most here: <a href="https://wetlandswatch.org/va-policy-updates">https://wetlandswatch.org/va-policy-updates</a></li> </ul> </li> </ul>
8.	Public Comment Period	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Q - Grace Tucker - "Has this 4VA study been published?"                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ A – Dr. Bukvic – Not yet, but hopefully by this summer. There have been delays due to the pandemic. I will gladly share the document with the committee. <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/17477891.2020.1804819">https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/17477891.2020.1804819</a></li> </ul> </li> <li>• Q - Roderick Scott, CFM, Board Chair, Flood Mitigation Industry Association – Does Virginia have a policy of relocation of the buildings in addition to the relocation of the population? Can Virginia adopt a policy of relocation of the buildings as we relocate the populations? The demolition and land filling of the demolition debris is a wasteful effort that is not sustainable at a time that we will need to have housing for relocated populations.                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ A – Weiss this is an interesting point, we need to take this into account. We need these kinds of perspectives on such a 360-degree problem. We do not want to create more harm than good.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
9.	Adjourn	Dr. Weiss asked for any final comments from the subcommittee members. No comments. Dr. Weiss asked for motion to adjourn. So moved, Elizabeth seconded. Motion passed unanimously. Meeting adjourned at 12:35pm.

Action Items			
#	Action Item	Owner (Organization)	Due Date
1.	Provide input to spreadsheet on initiatives and mechanisms from other states on relocation, and edit/add the columns, if necessary, to identify the information students should collect.	All	TBD
2.	Provide a writeup on research as it relates to relocation to be shared with the rest of the working group.	Dr. Anamaria Bukvic	TBD
3.	Provide a writeup on the legal aspects of relocation to be shared with the rest of the working group.	Elizabeth Andrews	TBD
4.	Send Doodle Poll to check availability in the last week of April/early-May to discuss the relocation workgroup.	Dr. Weiss	TBD
5.	If anyone has time or assistance to offer for the research project, or will have a grad student or RA over the summer, please contact Dr. Weiss.	All	TBD

If you have any questions, please contact Ashley Samonisky, Vision Planning and Consulting, at [asamonisky@vision-pc.net](mailto:asamonisky@vision-pc.net).